

Research and Library Services



Northern Ireland Assembly

Research Paper 87/08

30<sup>th</sup> June 2008

# **RESIDENTS' PARKING SCHEMES – A COMPARATIVE STUDY**

Research and Library Services

This paper provides a comparative study of Residents' Parking Schemes operating within the UK and the Republic of Ireland. It provides information on the Residents' Parking Scheme introduced in Belfast and considers the comparable case studies of Nottingham, Newcastle upon Tyne and Glasgow. The paper also outlines the diverse range of charges for resident permits found within the major cities of the UK and the Republic of Ireland.

Research Papers are compiled for the benefit of Members of The Assembly and their personal staff. Authors are available to discuss the contents of these papers with Members and their staff but cannot advise members of the general public.

## SUMMARY OF KEY POINTS

Residents' Parking Schemes have been introduced in most of the UK and Irish cities. These schemes are similar in nature however, have varying charging schemes, implementation details, objectives and impacts.

### COMPARATIVE SCHEMES

Table 1 below highlights key characteristics of Residents' Parking Schemes found within the case study examples of Belfast, Nottingham, Newcastle upon Tyne and Glasgow.

Table 1: Key characteristics of Residents' Parking Schemes found within the UK

Purpose	Operation details	Charging and Funding	Issues
<b>Belfast</b>			
Removal of all-day commuter parking and to allow residents priority in parking close to their homes.	Creation of 5 Controlled Parking Zones (CPZs) where parking is only permitted if a pay and display ticket or official permit is displayed.  The remainder of the kerbside space is subject to yellow line restrictions.	Resident Permits: £40/ £80. Visitor Permits: £12.50 for 25 daily permits or 50 daily permits if a senior citizen.  Business Permits: £80.  Concessions apply for blue badge holders and carers.  Scheme is to cost £185k and is designed to be self-financing.	Significant dissatisfaction expressed by the community with proposed charges.
<b>Nottingham</b>			
Removal of all-day commuter parking and to allow residents priority in parking close to their homes.	55 residents' parking schemes in operation through the use of CPZs.  Permits are issued to residents, businesses and students.  Zones typically in operation between the hours of 8am – 6pm.	Resident / Visitor / Business Permits: Free of Charge.  Official Visitors and Contractors: £25.  £30k allocated per annum from Council Capital budget to fund scheme. Remaining funding achieved through paid permits and penalty notices.	Annual survey indicates that the number of satisfied customers far outweighs dissatisfied customers.  Elected members are not in support of charging for permits due to economic conditions.
<b>Newcastle upon Tyne</b>			
Commuter parking problems, road safety and to allow priority for residents to park.	Permit system operated with restrictions in operation for two periods during the day.	<u>Proposed charges</u> Residents' Permit: £20, £40, £70.  Visitors Permit: £10.  Supplementary Permits: £20 per book of 20 daily permits.  Business Permits: £82 –	Schemes have been well received by residents and have addressed parking problems.  However, due to increased demand, schemes are considered

		<p>£587 for first 2 permits depending on location. Price rises as number of permits rises.</p> <p>Tradesman and Landlord permits available.</p> <p>Charity concessions available.</p> <p>Discounts available for low emission vehicles.</p>	<p>unsustainable.</p> <p>A major review of the scheme is underway. Key proposals include sliding charges for additional permits and discounts for eco-friendly vehicles.</p>
<b>Glasgow</b>			
Removal of commuter parking and restriction of traffic within City Centre	Shared use resident parking schemes and pay and display areas.	<p>Residents: £250 (City Centre); £50 (peripheral residential areas). Business Permit: £700. Pay and Display: variable.</p> <p>'Pay and display' schemes more than cover the cost of implementing schemes.</p>	<p>Glasgow restricts the issue of permits to 80% of available spaces.</p> <p>The Council states that this allows for the correct balance for 'shared use' and is considered successful.</p>

## CHARGING AND FUNDING

Charging residents for permits has been the primary grievance of communities in Belfast and it is evident that charging schemes vary considerably across the UK and Ireland. These variations can be found for resident, visitor and business permits. Variations result as scheme objectives vary. For example:

- schemes are designed to be self-financing through permit or penalty collections. (Edinburgh, Liverpool, Cardiff);
- local authorities may have access to funding to subsidise large portions of the scheme. (Nottingham, Plymouth);
- schemes may be designed to influence demand and take traffic off the road-side completely. (City of London, Glasgow);
- some are financed through developer contributions and the principle of the '*congestor pays*'. (Newcastle: schemes have been paid for by businesses and residential developers creating the congestion; Salford: schemes funded by local hospital); and
- schemes have been used to encourage the use of greener vehicles. (Newcastle, Westminster, Bristol).

In all cases considered, the schemes have been successful in delivering the removal or reduction of all-day commuter traffic.

## ALTERNATIVE STRATEGIES

All Local Authorities contacted accepted that residents' parking schemes require to be considered in the context of their wider transportation strategies.

Options considered by various local authorities include: congestion charges, park and ride schemes and public transport improvements.

## CONTENTS

Introduction .....	1
Residents Parking Schemes in Belfast .....	1
Case Study 1: Residents' Parking Schemes in Nottingham .....	3
Case Study 2: Residents' Parking Schemes in Newcastle upon Tyne .....	5
Case Study 3: Residents' Parking Schemes in Glasgow .....	6
Comparative Charging Structures in UK and Republic of Ireland Cities .....	8
The Green Debate .....	9

## **INTRODUCTION**

Residents' Parking Schemes have been introduced in most of the UK and Irish cities. Whilst these schemes are similar in nature, they have varying charging schemes, implementation details, objectives and impacts.

Space on a public road cannot be reserved for any individual. A Residents' Parking Scheme is therefore one solution to allow local residents some priority in parking close to their homes and address the problems associated with all-day commuter parking.

This paper considers the following,

- Residents' Parking Schemes in Belfast
- Case Study 1: Residents' Parking Schemes in Nottingham
- Case Study 2: Residents' Parking Schemes in Newcastle upon Tyne
- Case Study 3: Residents' Parking Schemes in Glasgow
- Comparative Charging Structures within UK and Republic of Ireland Cities
- The Green Debate

## **RESIDENTS' PARKING SCHEMES IN BELFAST**

In April 2008, the Minister for Regional Development announced the start of the consultation process on the first five residents' parking schemes in Belfast. The schemes are located in five local communities situated on the periphery of Belfast City Centre. All areas are within Neighbourhood Renewal Areas.

The five city centre schemes comprise the following areas:

- Barrack Street;
- Donegall Pass;
- Sandy Row;
- The Markets; and
- Brown Square.

### **Purpose of Scheme**

These communities have been subject to the negative impacts associated with all-day commuter parkers. Residents have voiced concern over an inability to park adjacent to their homes, the associated health and safety impacts arising from restricted traffic progression for essential and non-essential services; and the general negative impact on quality of life.

### **Details of Schemes**

The schemes involve the creation of Controlled Parking Zones (CPZs). These are areas where all on-street parking is controlled and parking is only permitted in designated parking areas or bays. Only vehicles displaying a valid permit or a 'pay and display' ticket can park during the hours the scheme is in operation.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Further information on schemes can be found at Residents' Parking website.  
<http://www.residentsparking.com/>

## Charges and Funding

<b>Table 1: Charges for Residents' Parking Permits in Northern Ireland</b>		
<b>Permit Type</b>	<b>Charge</b>	<b>Allowed allocation</b>
Resident Permits	£80	Dependent upon number of available spaces
Resident Permits within Neighbourhood Renewal Area	£40	Dependent upon number of available spaces
Visitor Permits	£12.50 for 25 daily permits	Max. 25 per quarter
Visitor Permits (for residents over 65)	£12.50 for 50 daily permits	Max. 50 per quarter
Business Permit	£80	Max. 2 per business
Blue Badge Holders	Free of Charge	1 per blue badge holder
Carers	Free of Charge	1 per carer
Pay and Display Parking	20p per 30 mins +	Maximum 2 hour stay

The cost of implementation and enforcement of the scheme within these areas has been set at £185,000. Charges are therefore proposed to ensure that the scheme becomes self financing.<sup>2</sup>

The penalty for violating the residents parking scheme will be a fine of £60, reduced to £30 if paid within 14 days.

### Public Opinion and Success of Scheme

Whilst residents are clearly satisfied with physical aspects of the scheme and the positive impact it will have on all-day commuter traffic, significant dissatisfaction has been expressed with the charges proposed.

The Residents' Parking Action Group stated that:

*"Residents should not be forced to pay for an issue that they did not create".<sup>3</sup>*

The Group further stated that, there had been considerable opposition to the charging scheme within the neighbourhoods (up to 90% in some areas); that there had been a low turnout to the Department's consultation; and that Belfast's overall transport strategy needed to be addressed.<sup>4</sup>

<sup>2</sup> As stated at Regional Development Committee, 18.06.08.

<sup>3</sup> Residents Parking Group, Regional Development Committee, 18.06.08.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*

**CASE STUDY 1: RESIDENTS' PARKING SCHEMES IN NOTTINGHAM<sup>5</sup>**

**Purpose of Scheme**

Nottingham is comparable in population size to Belfast. It is one of the most deprived cities in England, partly due to the decline of its key industries.

Neighbourhoods on the outskirts of the city centre have been affected by commuter and shopper traffic resulting from increased parking charges in the City Centre. Residents' Parking schemes have been adopted to alleviate this issue and allow residents' priority in parking close to their homes.<sup>6</sup>

**Details of Scheme**

Nottingham currently operates 55 residents' parking schemes through the use of CPZs.

The schemes involve the issue of permits to residents, students, businesses, contractors and official visitors. Schemes are typically in operation between 8am-8pm.

Figure A & B: Nottingham Residents' Parking Images<sup>7</sup>



**Charges and Funding**

Table 2: Charges for Residents' Parking Permits in Nottingham		
Permit Type	Charge	Allowed allocation
Resident Permits	Free of Charge	1 resident permit and 2 visitor permits, or, 2 resident permits and 1 visitor permit.
Visitor Permits	Free of Charge	1 visitor permit and 2 resident permits or 2 visitor permits and 1 resident permit.
Business Permit	Free of Charge	Maximum 2 per business.
Official Visitors and Contractors	£25	No limit.

Nottingham City Council currently allocates £30k per year for the Residents' Parking Programme out of its Capital Budget. This allows for the review of existing programmes, investigation of new programmes and implementation of approximately 2 new schemes per year.

<sup>5</sup> Discussion with Nottingham City Council, 24<sup>th</sup> June 2008.

<sup>6</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>7</sup> Images supplied by Nottingham City Council.

Given the high population of students within the area, the Council reports the significant cost of maintaining the infrastructure of existing schemes. The authority loses a lot of parking signs which need replacing.<sup>8</sup>

Charging for permits has been considered by Nottingham City Council. However, given the economic conditions affecting the city, Elected Members have not supported the imposition of charges.<sup>9</sup>

Penalties are issued to vehicles not displaying a permit which are set at £70 or £50 depending on the offence. Whilst these charges supplement the cost of the schemes, it would not be possible for them to become self-financing on this revenue alone. Evaluation of one scheme in Nottingham confirmed the issue of only 1.2 penalty tickets per week.

### **Public Opinion and Success of Scheme**

Schemes are only introduced where there is an overriding support from residents.

Annual surveys are undertaken to gauge public opinion on each of the schemes. The 2007 annual survey indicates that the number of satisfied customers far outweighs the dissatisfied.

Other headline results for the 2007 period include:<sup>10</sup>

- Overall quality and efficiency of service is rated as: 3% poor, 39% good, and 58% very good.
- The main reason for a 'poor' rating was that residents would like the facility of 2 visitor permits instead of 1 and renewal notification.
- Aspects of the service that customers were most dissatisfied with were: administration errors (43%); not enough spaces available (14%); wardens not seen often enough (14%); not enough parking spaces available (14%); too long for permits to arrive (7%); and still receive fines with permit displayed (7%).

### **Alternative Strategies**

A number of alternative methods have been considered and are in operation. For example, one such area did not meet the criteria for a Residents' Parking scheme due to the availability of off-street parking. A single yellow line restricting the traffic between the hours of 1-2pm has been implemented as traffic from a nearby hospital was causing negative impacts to residents. Residents are not exempted from these restrictions but the response remains largely positive.<sup>11</sup>

In other areas, marked parking bays have been laid out on footways to enable the clear passage of emergency services.

The City Council recognises that residents' parking and the impact of commuter traffic must be addressed as part of their wider Transportation Strategy. Key proposals of Nottingham's Transport Plan include maximising the effect of existing

---

<sup>8</sup> Nottingham City Council, Traffic Management, Email dated 26.06.08.

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>10</sup> Nottingham City Council, Residents Parking Survey, 2007.; [http://monitor.isa/551982468/557342648T080630154950301850.txt.binXMysM0dapplication/mwordXsysM0dhttp://www.nottinghamcity.gov.uk/cdpsresidents\\_survey\\_2007.doc](http://monitor.isa/551982468/557342648T080630154950301850.txt.binXMysM0dapplication/mwordXsysM0dhttp://www.nottinghamcity.gov.uk/cdpsresidents_survey_2007.doc)

<sup>11</sup> Nottingham City Council, Traffic Management, Email dated 26.06.08.



transport networks, reducing traffic growth and encouraging the use of alternatives to the car, particularly for journeys to work, school and higher education.

Individual measures include; higher quality bus services; integration of public transport services; upgrading the ring road; park and ride facilities; smarter travel choices marketing campaign; comprehensive parking strategy; decriminalised parking enforcement; improvements to the walking and cycling network; and the introduction of Traffic Managers and Signing.<sup>12</sup>

## **CASE STUDY 2: RESIDENTS' PARKING SCHEMES IN NEWCASTLE UPON TYNE**

### **Purpose of Scheme**

Residents' parking has been in operation in Newcastle upon Tyne since 1993. Schemes were introduced to address the problem of commuter parking, road safety and afford residents some priority to park their cars in proximity to their homes.

The number of permits issued has more than doubled in the last four years, with current distribution in the region of 10,000 permits. Given that car ownership continues to grow within the city, the City Council views this as unsustainable and is currently undergoing a review of the conditions and operations of permit parking schemes.<sup>13</sup>

### **Details of Scheme**

The majority of residents' parking schemes are based on Controlled Parking Zones (CPZs). Permits are required to park within these areas. Permit parking would typically be in operation Monday – Friday for two periods during the day for example, between 10-11am and 3-4pm.<sup>14</sup>

### **Charges and Funding**

A Review is currently ongoing with regards to the charging details of the scheme. One of the primary recommendations is that a sliding scale of charges should be introduced for additional permits. The proposed charges are outlined below.

<b>Permit Type</b>	<b>Proposed Charge</b>	<b>Allowed allocation</b>
Resident's Permit	£20 for 1 <sup>st</sup> ; £40 for 2 <sup>nd</sup> ; £70 for 3 <sup>rd</sup> .	Maximum 2 in most places.
Visitors' Permit	£10.00 per annum	Maximum 1 per dwelling
Supplementary Permits	£20 per book of 20 (full day); or £10 per book of 20 (half day).	60 per annum
Landlord Permits	£20 for 1 <sup>st</sup> book of 10; £40 per 2 <sup>nd</sup> book of 10 and £80 for 3 <sup>rd</sup> book of 10.	Maximum of 30 full day permits per annum
Tradesman Permits	£7.50 per daily permit or £30 for a weekly permit.	N/A
Business Permit	£82 - £578 depending on location	Maximum of 10 with sliding

<sup>12</sup> Nottingham City Council, Local Transport Plan 2007/08 – 2010/11.

[http://www.nottinghamcity.gov.uk/cdt\\_ltp\\_executive\\_summary.pdf](http://www.nottinghamcity.gov.uk/cdt_ltp_executive_summary.pdf)

<sup>13</sup> Discussion with Newcastle City Council, 19<sup>th</sup> June 2008.

<sup>14</sup> <http://www.newcastle.gov.uk/core.nsf/a/parkingpermits>

<sup>15</sup> Newcastle City Council, Review of Residents' Permit Scheme, <http://www.newcastle.gov.uk/core.nsf/a/parkingreviewpermitschemes?opendocument>

	for 1-2 permits. 6-10 permits can cost up to £1,734 each.	charges
Charity Permits	First 2 free	Maximum 10.
Permits for low emission vehicles	Discounts of 50% on residents, business and charity permits.	As above.

The cost of permits covers administration fees relating to the processing of applications and contributes to the implementation and enforcement costs of the scheme. Schemes are designed to be self-financing.

Recently, Newcastle City Council has secured funding from a local supermarket to implement a scheme. This principle of the 'congestor pays' has also been used to secure scheme funding from residential developers.<sup>16</sup>

### **Public opinion and Success of Scheme**

Permits have been well received by residents and have addressed long term parking problems. Newcastle City Council acknowledges that the system does not always meet the needs of all road users and can on occasions lack flexibility for residents, particularly those who hold social functions or those who require higher levels of care and support.

The City Council is aware that the Residents' Parking scheme is unsustainable given the rising number of permits issued. The Council has recently undertaken independent research to establish Best Practice across Local Authorities. This has led to a series of changes to the existing policy which mostly involve sliding charges for additional permits and the introduction of discounts for eco-friendly vehicles.

Discussion with Newcastle City Council confirmed that they were very aware of certain sensitivities between the public and themselves as a result of the increase in proposed charges. The Council has taken the stance that because the residents living within the controlled parking zones are receiving an extra service, it would be unfair to impose the burden on the overall authority budget.<sup>17</sup>

These sensitivities are heightened due to the fact that discounts previously given to those on Job Seekers Allowance are being reviewed and may not be implemented within the new proposals.

### **CASE STUDY 3: RESIDENTS' PARKING SCHEMES IN GLASGOW**

#### **Purpose of Scheme**

Schemes in Glasgow are designed to minimise the effect of commuter traffic in both City Centre and residential areas.

#### **Details of scheme**

Glasgow operates shared use residents' parking schemes. This involves the use parking permits together with pay and display facilities. Residents can park with the use of a permit and all other vehicles must pay and display. Apart from Blue Badge holders, who receive a permit for free, no concessions are offered. Schemes either operate between 8am and 6pm or 8am and 10pm.<sup>18</sup>

<sup>16</sup> Discussion with Newcastle City Council, 19<sup>th</sup> June 2008.

<sup>17</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>18</sup> <http://www.glasgow.gov.uk/en/Residents/GettingAround/Parking/residentsparking/>

## Charges and Funding

<b>Permit Type</b>	<b>Charge</b>	<b>Allowed allocation</b>
Resident's Permit	£250 (city centre); £50 (peripheral)	Not restricted.
Visitor's Permit	£2 per 6 hr period.	40 + per year
Business Permit	£700	Limited.
Pay and Display	Charges vary	Maximum duration varies.

Glasgow operates two levels of charge: £250 for those living in the City Centre and £50 per permit in the surrounding areas. A higher rate was assigned to the City Centre as parking is extremely restricted, dwellers tend to be more affluent and it was desirable to limit congestion.

Although Glasgow City Council found that the 'pay and display' income is more than paying for the operation of the residents' parking schemes, it was always felt that a value should be assigned to the permits to give them intrinsic value.<sup>20</sup>

### **Public Opinion and Success of Scheme**

Glasgow had initially decided to only issue one permit per residence up to a maximum of 1.1 permits per space but have to date restricted permits to 80% of spaces. They feel this gives the tight balance for 'shared use' and evidence on the ground would agree with this.<sup>21</sup>

Pay and Display has not discouraged all commuters from 'feeding the meter' during the day but the results have been generally positive.

One of the major issues faced by Glasgow was the amount of parking provided with new developments. As of 1st January 2000, any newly built developments were not eligible for residents' permits. The Council note that whilst results were slow to begin with, the positive impacts of such policy are evident.<sup>22</sup>

<sup>19</sup> Glasgow City Council,

<sup>20</sup> Roads Service Study Tour, Glasgow City Council, April 2007.

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>22</sup> *Ibid.*

**COMPARATIVE CHARGING STRUCTURES IN UK AND REPUBLIC OF IRELAND CITIES**

Table 5 below provides a comparison of charges levied for Residents' Parking Schemes within UK and Irish Cities.

<b>Table 5: Comparison of Charges for Residents' Parking Permits in UK and Irish Cities (£ per Year)<sup>23</sup></b>		
<b>City</b>	<b>1st Resident's Permit</b>	<b>Additional Permits<sup>24</sup></b>
London City	£740	Standard charge
London Boroughs	£35 - £220 depending on location and engine size	Sliding charge
Birmingham	£185 (city centre); £15 (residential)	Sliding charge
Leeds	Free of Charge	Standard charge
Glasgow	£250 (city centre); £50 (peripheral residential)	Standard charge
Sheffield	£36	2nd permit £72.
Edinburgh	£160 (city centre); £80 (peripheral residential)	Standard
Liverpool	Free of Charge	Standard
Manchester	£116 - £347 depending on location	Standard
Bristol	Free of Charge - £40 depending on engine size	2nd permit £70; 3rd permit £200.
Wakefield	Free of Charge	Standard
Cardiff	£5	2nd £30, 3rd £45, 4th £60.
Nottingham	Free of Charge	Standard
Leicester	£10	2nd permit £20.
Newcastle	£20	2nd permit £40, 3rd permit £70.
Brighton	£104 (centre); £60 (peripheral)	Waiting lists for 1 permit in operation.
Hull	£100 (city centre); £5 (peripheral); £0 (stadium)	Standard
Plymouth	£30	Standard
Stoke	£70 (non-senior citizens); £35 (senior citizens)	Standard
Swansea	Free of Charge	Standard
Southampton	Free of Charge - 1 area £57.50	2nd - £57.50.
Westminster	£115 - Free of Charge depending on engine size	Standard
Portsmouth	Free of Charge	2nd permit £50, 3rd permit £100.
York	£90	Standard
Peterborough	£15	Standard
Dundee	£70 (city centre), £50 (suburbs), £5 (peripheral)	Standard
Oxford	£40	3rd permit £80, 4th permit £120.
Newport	£10	Standard
Dublin City	£31.60 for 1 yr / £55.30 for 2 yrs <sup>25</sup>	Standard
Cork	£7.90	Standard
Galway	£7.90	Standard
Limerick	£5.00	Standard
Waterford	£11.85	Standard

<sup>23</sup> Figures gathered from individual local authorities in June 2008.

<sup>24</sup> Note: there are restrictions in almost all cases on the number of permits available for allocation.

<sup>25</sup> Euros converted to Sterling at a rate of €1=£0.79.

## **THE GREEN DEBATE**

More recently, residents' parking schemes have been used by local authorities as a tool to encourage the use of environmentally friendly vehicles.

Schemes found in Newcastle, Bristol and Westminster have all introduced discounts for vehicles with low emission levels.

A 50% discount on the price of £20 is offered to light passenger vehicles that have low CO<sub>2</sub> emissions in Newcastle.

In Westminster, residents with 'eco-vehicles' (ie those using gas, electricity, fuel cells and hybrid vehicles) will qualify for free residents parking permits.<sup>26</sup>

Eco-tariffs are particularly common in the London Boroughs. In 2007, Richmond Council tripled the cost of residents' parking for the most polluting cars and in Lambeth, the most polluting cars are charged up to £200 for a permit.<sup>27</sup>

This is a timely debate in terms of the recent climate control statements made by Lord Stern. In his 2006 report, he stated that countries needed to spend 1% of their GDP to stop greenhouse gases rising to dangerous levels. Failure to do this would lead to damage which would cost much more, at least 5% and up to 20% of GDP.<sup>28</sup>

In June 2008, Lord Stern stated that climate change is happening faster than previously thought. 2% of GDP is now required to curb emission levels and this requires authorities to act quickly.<sup>29</sup>

---

<sup>26</sup> <http://www.westminster.gov.uk/transportandstreets/parking/residentsparking/resparkecovehicles.cfm>

<sup>27</sup> [http://www.richmond.gov.uk/residents\\_parking#controlled\\_parking\\_zones;](http://www.richmond.gov.uk/residents_parking#controlled_parking_zones;)  
<http://www.lambeth.gov.uk/Services/TransportStreets/Parking/CPZs.htm>

<sup>28</sup> Stern Review, The Economics of Climate Change, 2006. [http://www.hm-treasury.gov.uk/media/4/3/Executive\\_Summary.pdf](http://www.hm-treasury.gov.uk/media/4/3/Executive_Summary.pdf)

<sup>29</sup> <http://www.guardian.co.uk/environment/2008/jun/26/climatechange.scienceofclimatechange>