

Research Paper 04/02

7 February 2002

PUBLIC APPOINTMENTS AND PUBLIC BODIES IN NORTHERN IRELAND

As at March 2000, there were 2,311 public appointments held in 118 public bodies in Northern Ireland. This Research Paper examines public bodies in Northern Ireland, and their possible reform in forthcoming Executive reviews. It also considers the public appointment process and the role of the Commissioner of Public Appointments for Northern Ireland. It looks at the monitoring of public appointments and equal opportunities issues and examines the number of appointments made by political affiliation, community background, and gender. Finally it considers approaches taken in Scotland and Wales.

Research Papers are compiled for the benefit of Members of the Assembly and their personal staff. Authors are available to discuss the contents of these papers with Members and their staff but cannot advise members of the general public.

SUMMARY OF KEY POINTS

- In 2000, there were 118 public bodies in Northern Ireland, responsible for an estimated £7 billion, out of a total of £11 billion public expenditure for Northern Ireland.
- 2. The Executive is planning a review of public administration to include public bodies, and also a separate review of the arrangements for making public appointments.
- 3. As at March 2000, there were 2,311 public appointments held in Northern Ireland. 461 appointments were made in 1999/2000. Whist some appointments are remunerated, the majority are not.
- 4. Appointments should be made on merit, but there are some inequalities in the number of appointments, for example between men and women.
- 5. Dame Rennie Fritchie was appointed Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland on 1st December 1999. This was intended as a temporary measure, pending an Assembly decision on the future of the post, although no decision has yet been announced. Her term of appointment will expire on 28 February 2002.
- 6. The Commissioner is independent of the Government and her role is to monitor, regulate and provide advice on departmental appointments procedures for certain listed public bodies. Only a minority of appointments are subject to review by the Commissioner of Public Appointments for Northern Ireland. The Commissioner has published a Code of Practice for appointments.
- 7. The Commissioner performs an annual audit to review the policies and practices of departments in making public appointments. Her most recent report, for 2000/2001, identifies some serious, if isolated, deficiencies.
- 8. The UK government has indicated that Departments should aim for a ratio of 50:50 for women and men in public appointments, and a pro-rata representation of members of ethnic minority groups.
- 9. OFMDFM has published an Action Plan for the Northern Ireland Departments, aimed at improving the public appointments process and addressing under-representation of women, disabled people, ethnic minorities, young people and people representing grass roots interests.
- 10. The Scottish Parliament is at present considering a Private Members Bill which provides that appointments made by or on the recommendation of the Scottish Ministers to certain public bodies may be scrutinized and approved by the Scottish Parliament.

CONTENTS

1.	Introduction	1
2.	Public bodies in Northern Ireland	1
	Public bodies inherited on devolution	1
	Reform on the horizon	2
3.	Public Appointments	3
	Types of public appointment	3
	Number of appointments held	3
	Number of appointments made	4
	Candidacy for public appointment	4
4.	The Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland	4
	Background	4
	The role of the Commissioner	5
	The Code of Practice and Guidance	6
	Independent scrutiny in the appointments process: independent assessors.	6
	Annual Audit	
5.	Monitoring of appointments	7
6.	Political activity and community background	7
7.	Equality of Opportunity	8
	U.K. Policy	
	Northern Ireland Action Plan	
8.	Some monitoring information on gender	9
9.	Scotland and Wales	.10

1. INTRODUCTION

Public appointments are those appointments made by Ministers or Departments to bodies which perform some public function. Such bodies are commonly known as 'quangos'.¹ As at March 2000, there were 2,311 public appointments held in 118 public bodies in Northern Ireland.² Many appointments are subject to review by the Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland, and the Commissioner has published a Code of Practice.

The Secretary of State for Northern Ireland noted in January 1998 that

Membership of public bodies enables the wider community to play an important role in influencing and shaping the provision of a whole range of services which are of critical importance. And this is particularly important in Northern Ireland where many public bodies are involved in areas which in Great Britain would be the responsibility of locally elected representatives.³

However, it has been recognised that placing such power in the hands of unelected appointees, rather than those *'locally elected representatives'*, may have contributed to a democratic deficit in Northern Ireland, and caused an *'accountability gap'*.⁴

This Research Paper, prepared by Research and Library Services, examines public bodies in Northern Ireland and their possible reform in forthcoming Executive reviews. It also considers the public appointment process and the role of the Commissioner of Public Appointments for Northern Ireland. It looks at the monitoring of public appointments and equal opportunities issues and examines some interesting statistical information. Finally it considers approaches taken in Scotland and Wales.

2. PUBLIC BODIES IN NORTHERN IRELAND

PUBLIC BODIES INHERITED ON DEVOLUTION

In 2000, it was estimated that public bodies were responsible for approximately \pounds 7 billion, out of a total of \pounds 11 billion public expenditure for Northern Ireland.⁵ The Belfast Telegraph estimated in 2000 that they had *'around ten times the spending power of local councils*.⁶

With this financial power came political power. Wilson commented in 1996 that *'real political power has been leaching out to quangos and agencies, and to the European Union'*.⁷ However, some commentators have noted that the exercise of power by public bodies may have had other effects. Morison notes that during Direct Rule

the idea of depoliticising government [was] pursued by removing issues that might have a political or constitutional character from the hands of regionally-based political processes. Of course, in Northern Ireland there are many issues - ranging from education and housing through to industrial investment and beyond - which can be interpreted as having political or constitutional significance. The result is that quangos have been given a whole range of jobs which elsewhere would be carried out through the political process...the removal of such functions from the political process, and the placing of individuals by government in positions of importance in such a way as to reflect the political and religious composition of society, does at least provide access to power to many who would be (and have been) disempowered under more 'democratic' methods ... the quango remains a potentially more democratic mechanism than a straightforward election in an unevenly divided and polarised society.⁸

Similarly, Meehan comments that

In one sense, the direct relationships between groups in civil society and departments or quangos mean Northern Ireland is a better example than Britain of participatory democracy.⁹

REFORM ON THE HORIZON

With devolution has come an opportunity for the Executive and Assembly to consider the role of public bodies and their exercise of power. The forthcoming review of public administration will consider these issues.

The Executive states in the Programme for Government that it recognises *'the important contribution made by those who hold public appointments*'.¹⁰ However, in its declared drive to create effective, accountable and responsive government,¹¹ it intends to

review public administration so that resources can be used best to serve the public rather than maintaining bureaucratic structures. We have inherited from the last 30 years a wide range of public bodies. Now that devolution has been achieved, there is an opportunity to provide greater accountability and to consider more coherent structures for delivering efficient and quality services ... We are committed to a comprehensive and strategic review of all aspects of the public sector.¹²

Mr Mallon, the then deputy First Minister, said in April 2001 that

Given the type of structures that have been created politically since the Good Friday Agreement, there is duplication of effort by the large number of public bodies.¹³

The review of public administration is to commence in spring 2002. It will include consideration of the role of public bodies.¹⁴

Furthermore, the Executive is planning, by summer 2002, a review of the arrangements for making appointments to public bodies.¹⁵

The Executive could, for example, use these opportunities to propose a transfer of power from unelected appointees to elected representatives. An alternative course of action would be to leave power in the hands of public bodies, but alter their appointments procedures, and improve accountability and openness.¹⁶

3. PUBLIC APPOINTMENTS

TYPES OF PUBLIC APPOINTMENT

There are 5 types of public appointments in Northern Ireland:

- to Executive non-departmental public bodies ('NDPBs'), which carry out administrative, regulatory, executive or commercial functions;
- to Advisory NDPBs, which provide independent, expert advice to Ministers and officials;
- to Tribunals, which have semi-judicial functions;
- to Boards of Visitors to penal institutions; and
- to various uncategorised bodies, e.g. the Community Relations Council and the Senate of Queen's University Belfast.¹⁷

Some appointments are remunerated. The majority are not.¹⁸

NUMBER OF APPOINTMENTS HELD

As at March 2000, there were 2,311 public appointments held in Northern Ireland, in a total of 118 bodies.¹⁹ It is interesting to note that this represents a significant decrease from the March 1998 figures of 2,799 public appointments held in 145 bodies (see Table 1).²⁰ Thirty bodies were either disbanded or replaced between March 1998 and March 2000, and three were created (Equality Commission for NI, NI Human Rights Commission and National Museums and Galleries of NI).²¹

Table 1

Appointments held, 1997-2000

Date	Appointments Held	Number of Bodies in which		
		appointments held		
March 1997	2948	145		
March 1998	2799	145		
March 1999	3031	141		
March 2000	2311	118		

Sources: Secretary of State for Northern Ireland First Annual Report on Public Appointments Vol 1 para 1.7; Secretary of State for Northern Ireland Second Annual Report on Public Appointments Vol 1 paras 1.11 and 2.7; CAU Public Appointments Annual Report 1998/1999 paras 1.11 and 3.6; CAU Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000²² paras 1.11 and 3.6

Following devolution, the Secretary of State for Northern Ireland remains responsible for appointments to only seven bodies, including the Police Authority for Northern Ireland and the Probation Board for Northern Ireland. 76 appointments are held on those bodies.²³

The six boards of the North/South Implementation Bodies are appointed by the North/South Ministerial Council.²⁴

NUMBER OF APPOINTMENTS MADE

461 appointments were made in 1999/2000 in Northern Ireland: see Table 2.25

Table 2 Appointments made, 1996/7-1999/2000

Year	Appointments made	
1996/1997		492
1997/1998		988
1998/1999		1050
1999/2000		461

Sources: Secretary of State for Northern Ireland First Annual Report on Public Appointments Vol 1 para 2.11; Secretary of State for Northern Ireland Second Annual Report on Public Appointments Vol 1 para 2.12; CAU Public Appointments Annual Report 1998/1999 para 3.11; CAU Pub

It will be seen that the number of appointments has fluctuated since 1996. This may be due to political factors such as local elections.²⁶

CANDIDACY FOR PUBLIC APPOINTMENT

Candidates for public appointment are identified from a number of sources:

- the Central Appointments Unit ('the CAU') of OFMDFM maintains a database of people who have indicated that they are willing to serve – currently containing around 5000 names;²⁷
- candidates may be put forward by nominating bodies, e.g. District Councils;
- a list of vacancies is regularly circulated to a range of bodies representing under-represented groups, and published on the internet; and
- candidates may nominate themselves in response to public advertisements of vacancies, rather like job advertisements.

Appointments should be made on merit, and the Departments generally apply the Code of Practice to all appointments.²⁸ Many appointments – but not all – are also subject to the review by the Commissioner of Public Appointments for Northern Ireland.²⁹ Despite this, there remain some inequalities in appointments, for example between men and women. This inequality is considered below.

4. THE COMMISSIONER FOR PUBLIC APPOINTMENTS FOR NORTHERN IRELAND

BACKGROUND

Concern over public appointments was widespread in 1995. The Committee on Standards in Public Life (then known as the Nolan Committee) concluded that the main weakness in the public appointments system was the absence of effective external scrutiny. One of its principal recommendations was the creation of an independent Commissioner for Public Appointments.³⁰

The Government of the day accepted this recommendation and subsequently created two posts: one to cover Great Britain and an equivalent post for Northern Ireland. The office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland ('the Commissioner') was created in 1995.³¹

The first Commissioner was Sir Leonard Peach, who was appointed to both posts (NI and GB) after a competitive selection process and took up office on 18 December 1995.

Dame Rennie Fritchie succeeded Sir Leonard as Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland on 1st December 1999, just prior to devolution, and currently holds both posts. This was intended as a temporary measure, pending an Assembly decision on the future of the post. Her term of appointment will expire on 28 February 2002.

THE ROLE OF THE COMMISSIONER

The Commissioner is independent of the Government and her role is to monitor, regulate and provide advice on departmental appointments procedures for executive non-departmental bodies and Health & Personal Social Services bodies. The Commissioner has no powers in relation to tribunals, although she is willing to give advice if requested.

Only 69 bodies, and approximately 850 appointments are currently within the remit of the Commissioner.³² Appointments to bodies within her remit have since 1996 been subject to the Commissioner's Guidance on Appointments.³³ That Guidance contains a short Code of Practice.³⁴ Sir Nigel Wicks, the current Chair of the Committee on Standards in Public Life, has commented that

The guidance of the Commissioner for Public Appointments is generally recognised as establishing best practice in the field of public appointments.³⁵

167 appointments were made to bodies within the Commissioner's remit in 1999/2000.³⁶ However, as OFMDFM records that a total of 461 appointments were made in 1999/2000,³⁷ it can be seen that the majority of public appointments are not within her remit and therefore not legally subject to the Guidance or Code of Practice. Nonetheless, the NI Departments claim to generally apply the Guidance to all appointments.³⁸

No bodies for which the NIO is responsible – for example the Equality Commission, the Boundary Commission, the Northern Ireland Human rights Commission and the Probation Board – fall under the remit of the Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland. However, they do fall under her remit as Commissioner for GB.³⁹

Appointment to the boards of the North/South Implementation Bodies are subject neither to the Code or Practice nor to review by the Commissioner.⁴⁰

THE CODE OF PRACTICE AND GUIDANCE

The OCPA states that the Code of Practice *'remains the cornerstone of the drive to create and maintain an efficient and transparent process of public appointments, which produces appointments made on merit and holds the confidence of the general public.'* The Code reflects the recommendations made by the Nolan Committee in its First Report and requires that all appointments to bodies subject to it must be based on the Seven Principles of Public Life (commonly known as 'the Nolan Standards'):⁴¹

- Ministerial responsibility;
- Merit;
- Independent scrutiny;
- Equal opportunities;
- Probity;
- Openness and Transparency; and
- Proportionality.

The Guidance provides detailed assistance on ensuring that an appointment procedure meets those principles. It requires that an appointment process include certain elements, including:

- the documentation of the appointments process;
- the use of advertisements and consultation to attract applicants;
- the use of detailed 'job' and 'person' specifications;
- shortlisting of candidates against clearly defined criteria;
- the interviewing of candidates;
- the use of an independent assessor and an advisory panel; and
- the introduction of formal performance assessment arrangements for those serving on public bodies; and
- publicising the appointment.

INDEPENDENT SCRUTINY IN THE APPOINTMENTS PROCESS: INDEPENDENT ASSESSORS

One of the seven principles contained within the code of practice is that of 'independent scrutiny'. No public appointment should, therefore, be made without at least one independent assessor being involved. The assessor is expected to act as the 'guardian' of the seven principles. However, as independent assessors may be paid by and provided support by the relevant Department, questions as to the level of their independence have been raised.⁴²

The Commissioner regards the role of the independent assessors as essential to fair appointments procedures.⁴³

ANNUAL AUDIT

The Commissioner performs an annual audit to review the policies and practices of departments in making public appointments, and to establish whether the Code of Practice is being observed. The Commissioner aims to review each department once every three years⁴⁴ with the results being published in her annual report.

Although the most recent audits show 'a number of areas where ... departments were generally performing well',⁴⁵ some important defects and inconsistencies have been identified. For example, the most recent report records that on two occasions in 2000/2001, monitoring information was left attached to application forms that went to members of the panel deciding on who to appoint.⁴⁶ The Commissioner described

this as an *'exceptional failure'*, and stressed its seriousness.⁴⁷ There have also been inconsistencies in drawing up person specifications, into which additional and unannounced criteria were introduced during the competitions for appointment.⁴⁸

5. MONITORING OF APPOINTMENTS

The Guidance requires departments to monitor certain information about appointments within the Commissioner's remit. She compiles the information in her annual report. Monitoring began in late 1996. The following information is currently monitored:

- gender;
- age;
- community background;
- remuneration;
- disability;
- political activity; and
- ethnic background.

The Central Appointments Unit of OFMDFM monitors all public appointments on the same standards as the Commissioner, and publishes its annual report in March. As this report covers all public bodies in Northern Ireland, it is a more useful source of statistics than the Commissioner's report.

Monitoring information on appointments to the boards of the North/South Implementation Bodies does not appear to be kept.⁴⁹

It is important to note that, except as regards gender, the monitoring information collected relates only to appointments made, and not more generally to appointments held. The information does not therefore provide a general breakdown of all public appointees currently in post. Nonetheless, the information provides a valuable picture appointments, for example in respect of political activity and community background.

6. POLITICAL ACTIVITY AND COMMUNITY BACKGROUND

Candidates for public appointment are asked to declare their involvement in political activity. The nature of what constitutes 'significant political activity' and how this can most properly be identified, however, was raised in the Fourth Report of the Committee on Standards in Public Life.

In response to this issue, the Commissioner included in the Guidance a revised question to determine a candidate's involvement in political activity.⁵⁰

Candidates are not however expected to divulge private membership of, or associations with (including donations to) a political party, or their voting habits.

Only 3.3% of those appointed in 1999/2000 declared political activity.⁵¹ The information set out in Table 3, which was included in the CAU's 1999/2000 annual report, details the party affiliation of those 205 applicants and 59 appointees who declared political activity.

Declared political activity of applicants and of appointments 1999/2000				
Affiliation	Applicants	Appointments		
UUP	58 (28%)	14 (24%)		
SDLP	38 (19%)	16 (27%)		
DUP	16 (8%)	2 (3%)		
SF	10 (5%)	3 (5%)		
Alliance	26 (13%)	3 (5%)		
Other	57 (28%)	21 (36%)		
Total	205	59		

Table 3Declared political activity of applicants and of appointments 1999/2000

Source: Sources: Secretary of State for Northern Ireland First and Second Annual Reports on Public Appointments and CAU Public Appointments Annual Reports 1998/1999 and 1999/2000, Tables 7 and 11

As noted above, community background is also monitored. Table 4 shows the community background of all appointees since 1996.

Table 4Community Background of appointments 1996/7 to 1999/2000

community buckground of appointments 1990/1 to 1995/2000				
Community	1999/2000	1998/99	1997/98	1996/97
background				
Roman	98 (21%)	260 (25%)	292 (30%)	113 (23%)
Catholic				
Protestant	168 (36%)	365 (35%)	411 (42%)	153 (31%)
Other or	195 (42%)	425 (40%)	285 (28%)	226 (46%)
not known				
Total	461	1050	988	492

Sources: Secretary of State for Northern Ireland First Annual Report on Public Appointments Vol 1 Table 4(g); Secretary of State for Northern Ireland Second Annual Report on Public Appointments Vol 1 Table 4(g); CAU Public Appointments Annual Report 1998/1999 Table 4(g); CAU Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000 Table 4(g)

7. EQUALITY OF OPPORTUNITY

UK POLICY

Within the overriding principle of appointment on merit the UK government has indicated that Departments should aim for a ratio of 50:50 for women and men in public appointments, and a pro-rata representation of members of ethnic minority groups.⁵² The UK government has also stated that Departments should aim for year-on-year increases in the proportion of appointments held by those with a disability.

The U.K. government launched <u>'Quangos: Opening up Public Appointments'</u> in June 1998. This policy initiative included an action plan based on two overall commitments:

The Government is committed, in principle, to the equal representation of women and men in public appointments, and a pro-rata representation of members of ethnic minority groups.

The Government is committed to appointment on merit, using fair selection procedures, which recognise non-traditional career patterns as suitable qualifications for appointments.⁵³

All departments were set specific targets, reviewed annually. The interests of persons with a disability were included for the first time in 2000. The NIO's current targets are:

- to increase the proportion of public appointments held by women to 45% by 2003;
- to monitor the proportions of female, ethnic minority group and disabled applicants for public appointments; and
- to continue to encourage applications from under represented groups.⁵⁴

NORTHERN IRELAND ACTION PLAN

In 1999, the CAU published an Action Plan, aimed at improving the public appointments process and addressing under-representation of women, disabled people, ethnic minorities, young people and people representing grass roots interests. The Action Plan applies to appointments to those bodies for which responsibility was devolved to the NI departments.⁵⁵ The Action Plan does not contain any specific proportion targets to match the UK 50:50 target referred to above.

Over recent years the CAU has co-ordinated a number of steps which have been taken in Northern Ireland to ensure that under-represented groups are not disadvantaged in the selection procedure for membership of a public body. These steps have included:

- holding discussions with relevant groups to hear their views on how their members might achieve greater representation on public bodies;
- wider dissemination of information about the appointments process;
- reviewing and where necessary revising application forms to make them less off-putting; and
- reviewing the specifications used for each public appointment to ensure that the criteria set do not disadvantage any particular group.⁵⁶

However inequalities remain, for example between men and women.

8. SOME MONITORING INFORMATION ON GENDER

The latest comprehensive breakdown of public appointments by gender, and as between public body chairpersons (who are generally better remunerated) and ordinary members is shown in Table 5.

Total Public Appointments held at 31 March 2000, by gender and type					
Male	Female	Total			
121 (74%)	42 (26%)	163			
1460 (68%)	688 (32%)	2148			
1581 (68%)	730 (32%)	2311			
	Male 121 (74%) 1460 (68%)	Male Female 121 (74%) 42 (26%) 1460 (68%) 688 (32%)			

Table 5

Source: CAU Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000

Table 5 shows that only about one third of all appointments were held by women in 2000. This is a small decrease on comparable figures from previous years, as shown in Table $6.^{57}$ It is also interesting to note that the imbalance in distribution of chairs is even greater.

Public Appointments held, 1997 to 2000, by gender				
	Male	Female	Total	
March 1997	1930 (65%)	1018 (35%)	2948	
March 1998	1821 (65%)	978 (35%)	2799	
March 1999	2002 (66%)	1029 (34%)	3031	
March 2000	1581 (68%)	730 (32%)	2311	

Table 6 Public Appointments held, 1997 to 2000, by gender

Sources: Secretary of State for Northern Ireland First and Second Annual Report on Public Appointments, CAU Public Appointments Annual Reports 1998/1999 and 1999/2000

It is interesting to compare this level of female representation with the UK target of 50:50 representation. The figures could also be compared with the level of female representation on those seven public bodies for which the NIO is responsible, which at 31 March 2001 was 39%.⁵⁸

Amongst the NI Executive departments, there is a considerable range in the proportion of appointments held by women. On latest figures, DARD shows the most imbalance: only 19% of the public appointments for which it is responsible are held by women. DHSSPS shows the least: 40% of its public appointments are held by women.⁵⁹

9. SCOTLAND AND WALES

The public bodies and public appointments system in Scotland is broadly similar to that in Northern Ireland. The Commissioner for Public Appointments has authority over Scottish public bodies, and the Scottish Executive states that most appointments to public bodies in Scotland are carried out in accordance with the Code of Practice and Guidance.⁶⁰ However, it is interesting to note that Scottish public bodies are responsible for spending only an estimated £800m.⁶¹

In February 2000, the Scottish Executive launched a major consultation exercise on modernising the public appointments system. Amongst other matters considered in the consultation was what role, if any, the Scottish Parliament should play in the appointments process.⁶²

In June 2001, Angus MacKay MSP, Minister for Finance and Local Government, published the report <u>'Public Bodies: Proposals for Change'</u>. He described the proposals as a *'major step forward in modernising the way Scotland runs itself'*. The report is comprehensive, dealing with, amongst other issues:

- the abolition, merger, or alteration of named bodies,
- changes to the way that public bodies operate,
- changes to the Scottish appointments process, and
- improvements to the accountability and governance of public bodies.⁶³

The Scottish Executive has not however brought forward legislation on the subject, and instead the Scottish Parliament is at present considering a Private Members Bill. Alex Neill MSP has introduced the Public Appointments (Parliamentary Approval) (Scotland) Bill. The provides that appointments made by or on the recommendation of the Scottish Ministers to certain public bodies may scrutinized and approved or rejected by the Scottish Parliament. The Bill gives the Parliament the power to veto appointment nominations if it decides that the nomination does not meet certain criteria set out in the Bill.⁶⁴

The general principles of the Bill have not, however, been approved by the Local Government Committee.⁶⁵ The Committee's Convenor Trish Godman MSP stated that *'the Committee is agreed that greater scrutiny of public appointments is indeed required. However we are not persuaded that this Bill as it currently stands is the most appropriate vehicle to provide such scrutiny.*⁶⁶ Accordingly, the Bill is unlikely to proceed further.

The National Assembly for Wales states that it places a high priority on increasing the representation of women, people of ethnic minority origin, and disabled people in public appointments. The National Assembly has set itself targets for improving the proportion of people from these groups who apply for appointments, as well as increasing the proportions from these groups who are appointed on merit.

> HUGH WIDDIS AND TIM MOORE 7 FEBRUARY 2002

LIST OF REFERENCES

Barry, Dr R 2001 unpublished research prepared by NI Assembly Research and Library Services

Belfast Telegraph <u>Quango budgets face cuts to offset Government costs</u> 8 January 2000

Cabinet Office 1998 Quangos: Opening up Public Appointments 1998-2001

Cabinet Office 2000 Quangos: Opening up Public Appointments 2000-2003

Central Appointments Unit 2000 Public Appointments Annual Report 1998/1999

Central Appointments Unit 2001 Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000

Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland 1996-2001 <u>Annual</u> <u>Reports</u>

Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland 1996 <u>Guidance on</u> <u>Appointments to Executive Non-Departmental Bodies and HPSS Bodies</u>

Committee on Standards in Public Life 1995 First Report Cm 2850-I

Democratic Dialogue 1996 <u>Power, Politics, Positionings: Women in Northern Ireland</u> Democratic Dialogue Report No. 4

Democratic Dialogue 1996 Reconstituting Politics Democratic Dialogue Report No. 3

Local Government Committee of the Scottish Parliament 2002 <u>Report on the Public</u> <u>Appointments (Parliamentary Approval) Bill</u>, Third Report

Local Government Committee of the Scottish Parliament News Release Local Government report agrees, by division, not to approve the general principles of Public Appointments Bill CLG 001/2002, 1 February 2002

NI Executive 2001 Programme for Government 2001

NI Executive 2001 Draft Programme for Government 2002-2004

Scottish Ministers 2001 Public Bodies: Proposals for Change

Scottish Ministers press release 21 June 2001 Review of Public Bodies

Secretary of State for Northern Ireland 1998 <u>First Annual Report on Public Appointments</u>

Secretary of State for Northern Ireland 1999 <u>Second Annual Report on Public</u> <u>Appointments</u>

Wicks, Sir Nigel 2001 Open letter to the Rt Hon Michael Martin MP the Speaker of the House of Commons

Agreement between the Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland and the Government of Ireland establishing implementation bodies done at Dublin on the 8th day of March 1999

Commissioner for Public Appointments (Northern Ireland) Order 1995

¹⁴ Response to AQO 1346/00, at <u>http://www.niassembly.gov.uk/record/010430.htm#6</u>

²⁰ Second Annual Report on Public Appointments 1997/1998

²¹ A full schedule of these changes, provided by OFMDFM, is available from Northern Ireland Assembly Research and Library Services

²² As corrected by information provided to NI Assembly Research and Library Services by OFMDFM 30 January 2002
²³ Cabinet Office 2000 Quangos: Opening up Public Appointments 2000-2003 at

²³ Cabinet Office 2000 Quangos: Opening up Public Appointments 2000-2003 at http://www.cabinet-office.gov.uk/central/2000/OpenPA/nio.htm

²⁴ Agreement between the Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland and the Government of Ireland establishing implementation bodies done at Dublin on the 8th day of March 1999

²⁵ <u>First and Second Annual Reports on Public Appointments</u>, and <u>Public Appointments Annual</u> <u>Reports 1998/1999 and 1999/2000</u>

²⁶ See, for example, the explanation given by the Secretary of State for Northern Ireland in her <u>Second Annual Report on Public Appointments</u> Introduction

²⁷ Central Appointments Unit <u>Public Appointments Annual Reports 1999/2000</u> para 1.13

²⁸ Central Appointments Unit <u>Public Appointments Annual Reports 1999/2000</u> para 2.1
²⁹ See below

³⁰ First Report of the Committee on Standards in Public Life

³¹ By the Commissioner for Public Appointments (Northern Ireland) Order 1995

³² Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland 2002 <u>Sixth Report 2000-2001</u> p 34

¹ An acronym for quasi-autonomous national governmental organisation

² Central Appointments Unit 2001 <u>Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000</u>, Volume 1, para 1.11. These are the latest available comprehensive figures

³ Secretary of State for Northern Ireland 1998 <u>First Report on Public Appointments 1996/97</u>, foreword

⁴ Wilford, R 1996 <u>Representing Women</u>, in *Power, Politics, Positionings: Women in Northern Ireland* Democratic Dialogue Report No. 4

⁵ Barry, Dr R 2001 unpublished research prepared by NI Assembly Research and Library Services

 $[\]frac{6}{2}$ Belfast Telegraph Quango budgets face cuts to offset Government costs 08 January 2000

⁷ Democratic Dialogue 1996 Reconstituting Politics Democratic Dialogue Report No. 3 p 6

⁸ Morison, J 1996 <u>Waiting for the big fix</u> in *Reconstituting Politics* Democratic Dialogue Report No. 3 p 17

⁹ Meehan, E 1996 <u>Democracy unbound</u> in *Reconstituting Politics* Democratic Dialogue Report No. 3 p 34

¹⁰ NI Executive 2001 <u>Programme for Government 2002-2004</u> para 7.3

¹¹ Programme for Government 2002-2004 para 7.1

¹² Programme for Government 2002-2004 paras 7.2 and 7.5

¹³ Response to AQO 1346/00, at <u>http://www.niassembly.gov.uk/record/010430.htm#6</u>

¹⁵ NI Executive 2001 <u>Programme for Government 2002-2004</u> para 7.3

¹⁶ See, for example, Morison's proposals in <u>Reconstituting Politics</u> p 20 et seq.

¹⁷ Central Appointments Unit 2001 Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000 paras 1.6-8

¹⁸ Secretary of State for Northern Ireland <u>First and Second Annual Reports on Public</u> <u>Appointments</u>, and Central Appointments Unit <u>Public Appointments Annual Reports</u> <u>1998/1999 and 1999/2000</u>

¹⁹ <u>Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000</u>, Volume 1, para 1.11, corrected by information provided to NI Assembly Research and Library Services by OFMDFM 30 January 2002

³³ The Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland 1996 <u>Guidance on</u> <u>Appointments to Executive Non-Departmental Bodies and HPSS Bodies</u>

³⁴ At Chapter 2

³⁵ In an open letter to the Rt Hon Michael Martin MP the Speaker of the House of Commons 13 December, 2001 at <u>http://www.public-standards.gov.uk/</u>

³⁶ Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland Sixth Report p 34

³⁷ Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000 para 3.11

³⁸ Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000 para 2.1

³⁹ Public Appointments Annual Report 2000/2001 vol 2

⁴⁰ See below

⁴¹ Guidance on Appointments para 2.2

⁴² See, for example, Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland 2001 <u>Fifth</u> <u>Report 1999-2000</u>, pp 10-1

⁴³ See, for example, Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland 2001 <u>Fifth</u> <u>Report 1999-2000</u>, pp 10-1 and 31 and Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland 2001 <u>Sixth Report 2000-2001</u>, pp 13-5

⁴⁴ Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland <u>Fifth Report 1999/2000</u> p 16
⁴⁵ See e.g. Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland <u>Sixth Report 2000/2001</u> p 17
⁴⁶ Operating State of the Public Appointment of the Public Appointme

⁴⁶ Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland Sixth Report 2000/2001 p 18

⁴⁷ Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland Sixth Report 2000/2001 p 4

⁴⁸ See e.g. Commissioner for Public Appointments <u>Sixth Report 2000/2001 p</u> 17, or

Commissioner for Public Appointments for Northern Ireland Fifth Report 1999/2000 p 13 ⁴⁹ Response of OFMDFM to AQW 17/99 and 191/99

⁵⁰ Annexed to the <u>Code of Practice</u>, available from <u>http://www.ocpa.gov.uk/index.htm</u>

⁵¹ Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000

⁵² Cabinet Office 1998 <u>Quangos: Opening up Public Appointments 1998-2001</u>, available at <u>http://www.cabinet-office.gov.uk/central/1998/pa/open/index.htm</u>

⁵³ Quangos: Opening up Public Appointments 1998-2001

⁵⁴ Cabinet Office 2000 Quangos: Opening up Public Appointments 2000-2003, available at http://www.cabinet-office.gov.uk/central/2000/OpenPA/nio.htm

⁵⁵ Public Appointments Annual Report 1998/1999 paras 2.3-8

⁵⁶ See e.g. <u>Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000</u> paras 2.5-8

⁵⁷ Determining a trend from this data should be treated with caution because of the short period over which it has been collected

⁵⁸ Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000 p 80

⁵⁹ Public Appointments Annual Report 1999/2000

⁶⁰ Information from the Scottish Executive Public Appointments web page at <u>http://www.scotland.gov.uk/government/publicappoint/default.asp</u>

⁶¹ Evidence of Alex Neil MSP to the Local Government Committee, in Local Government Committee of the Scottish Parliament 2002 <u>Report on the Public Appointments (Parliamentary Approval) Bill</u>, 3rd Report

⁶² Scottish Ministers 2001 Public Bodies: Proposals for Change para 25

⁶³ Scottish Ministers press release <u>Review of Public Bodies</u> 21 June 2001, at <u>http://www.scotland.gov.uk/government/publicappoint/latest.asp</u>

⁶⁴ Explanatory Notes to the Public Appointments (Parliamentary Approval) Bill

⁶⁵ Local Government Committee of the Scottish Parliament, 2002 <u>Report on the Public</u> <u>Appointments (Parliamentary Approval) Bill</u>, 3rd Report, para 90

⁶⁶ Scottish Parliament Local Government Committee News Release <u>Local Government report</u> agrees, by division, not to approve the general principles of Public Appointments Bill CLG 001/2002, 1 February, 2002